Reviewer's report

Title: Prognostic value of p27Kip1 expression in Basaloid Squamous Cell Carcinoma of the larynx.

Version: 3 Date: 14 March 2006

Reviewer: Tim Helliwell

Reviewer's report:

General

The authors have addressed satisfactorily the issues raised in the original review. In providing more detailed information on the raw data, a discrepancy has been identified that has to be resolved (see below).

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. Table II provides the raw data used to generate the summary data for table III that has been used in the statistical analysis. Unfortunately table II indicates that for case 6, the p27 expression was high (>50%) while table III indicates that it was low. This discrepancy significantly affects the text of the results (page 6, first sentence) as this would indicate that 1 patient who died from disease had a high p27 level - not 0% as currently indicated in the text. I presume that this may also affect the discriminant analysis.

The authors need to indicate how this discrepancy is to be resolved.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.