Reviewer's report

Title: Association Between Dietary Fat and Skin Cancer in an Australian Population Using Case-Control and Cohort Study Designs

Version: 2 Date: 28 February 2006

Reviewer: Teresa T Fung

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The major issue with this analysis is the lack of energy adjustment. However, since the authors used a questionnaire specifically for fat intake, total energy intake could not be calculated. Therefore it is crucial that the authors discuss how lack of energy adjustment would bias the direction and magnitude of the results.

2. At the end of the first paragraph in the discussion section, I think the wording is a little too strong on the relationship between fat intake and skin cancer. Afterall, the authors were unable to adjust for energy intake.

-------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. In the abstract, please state how long was the follow-up.

2. On page 5, "statistical analyses", line 5, please list what confounders were controlled for.

3. Page 6, "results": regarding the correlation coefficients. Please clarify if these were Pearson or Spearman. If they were Pearson, was normality assumption met? Please also include p values.

4. Table 1, please also include information such as sun sensitivity and demographic information. If those were published before, please summarize in the text.

-------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.