Reviewer's report

Title: HIV and pre-neoplastic and neoplastic lesions of the cervix in South Africa: a case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 22 April 2006

Reviewer: Stephen E Hawes

Reviewer's report:

General

This manuscript is much improved and makes much better use the strong data.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Within the new results section regarding Table 1, some of the information is incorrect. Cases were LESS likely to have a history of hormonal contraception. Please double check all of the new data.

There are many typos throughout:

In abstract, the OR for cervical cancer had extra spaces in it.

On page 8, double commas

Line spacing in results section is inconsistent.

Table 1: ) missing with regards to divorces/separated

>= 16 years for sexual debut (not 6)

P-values should be <0.001, as 0.000 is not appropriate.

Asterisk should be added to P-value column heading

Add significant digits to percentages (ex. 82.0 for HSIL HIV-)

Consistency between use of ',', ' and '.' for decimal places in Tables 2 and 3.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Perhaps in Table 2, you could add a row for the HIV info and odds ratio for invasive cervical cancer, as I believe that is one of your main study findings. I understand that it gets complicated for where to put the adjusted OR, since you have a different reference category. Perhaps another column for the Adjusted OR, showing the combined reference group of all Normal through HSIL, would work.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No