Reviewer's report

Title: HIV and pre-neoplastic and neoplastic lesions of the cervix in South Africa: a case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 21 April 2006

Reviewer: Gary M Clifford

Reviewer's report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Please refer to "high-risk HPV" and not just "HPV" throughout the text and tables.

This clarity is of particular importance since the inclusion of the new table 3. This table appears to show that HIV increases the risk of SIL among HPV NEGATIVE women, by an odds ratio of 6.5. This of course, is not true - many low-risk HPV types can cause SIL, especially in HIV-positive women, which likely explains the OR.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests