Reviewer's report

Title: Analysis of folylpoly-gamma-glutamate synthetase gene expression in human B-precursor ALL and T-lineage ALL cells

Version: 2 Date: 2 March 2006

Reviewer: Thomas Efferth

Reviewer's report:

The paper of Leclerc et al. deals with the functional analysis of the minimal FPGS promotor region and its relevance for the differential expression in Bp-ALL and T-ALL. The authors did not find an explanation for the differential FPGS expression.

Negative results may be as valuable as positive ones, if they finally help to elucidate relevant molecular mechanisms. Therefore, this kind of manuscript should also considered worth publishing. There is, however, some reluctance on the manuscript in its present form:

The number of cell lines to establish a real difference in FPGS expression between the two leukemia entities is too small to convince the reader. According to generally acknowledged statistical considerations, at least 6-8 cell lines of each tumor type should be analyzed.

How many independent experiments have been performed to verify the data shown in figures 3 and 4, respectively? I guess it was each one experiment, which of course is too less.

Thomas Efferth

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests