Reviewer’s report

Title: Growth and metastases formation of human malignant mesothelioma cell lines orthotopically implanted into the pleural cavity of immunodeficient mice.

Version: 8 Date: 26 September 2005

Reviewer: John Edwards

Reviewer’s report:

General
This is an interesting article describing a new technique to mimic the human pattern of disease progression in malignant mesothelioma. It should provide the basis for interesting studies in the future. Injection of the pleural cavity of small animals can be hazardous and the authors are to be congratulated for developing a successful model. In general, the manuscript is written well, although there are several areas where English grammar and spelling requires correction.

-------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The methodology and presentation of the results is acceptable. As stated above, attention to spelling and grammar is required throughout the manuscript.

-------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
In the text, it is stated that there was a take rate of 100% with the IST-Mes3 cells. I do not understand the left hand column of Table 2. What do the 1,2,3,4,5 represent - individual animals or groups of experiments?

-------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
None

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests