Reviewer’s report

Title: A case of spontaneous regression of bone metastasis from renal cell carcinoma; Case Report

Version: 1 Date: 13 June 2005

Reviewer: Bruno Fuchs

Reviewer’s report:

These authors present a well written and interesting case report regarding spontaneous regression of a renal cell carcinoma metastasis to the sternum. Whereas this case is certainly intriguing, I have some limitations regarding its publication. It is unclear why this patient was operated (for the metastasis) 14 months after biopsy. More importantly, the authors mentioned that the resection was PARTIAL. This implies that there was no complete histological assessment of the entire tumor. Therefore, full evidence of complete spontaneous regression (as mentioned on page 4) is lacking. Above all, the follow-up of three months is therefore too limited. In the discussion, the authors mention that the phenomenon of regression may have been induced subsequent to the biopsy. This is too speculative (coincidence), and there is no evidence at all. For these reasons, I'd be hesitant to publish this article.