Author's response to reviews

Title: A case of spontaneous regression of bone metastasis from renal cell carcinoma; Case Report

Authors:

Takahiro Nakajima (nakajii@fc.med.miyazaki-u.ac.jp)
Makoto Suzuki (smakoto@chiba-cc.jp)
Soichiro Ando (sando@chiba-cc.jp)
Tomohiko Iida (tiida@chiba-cc.jp)
Akinobu Araki (aaraki@chiba-cc.jp)
Takehiko Fujisawa (fujisawat@faculty.chiba-u.jp)
Hideki Kimura (lung@chiba-cc.jp)

Version: 3 Date: 31 August 2005

Author's response to reviews: see over
Takahiro Nakajima M.D.

Division of Thoracic Diseases, Chiba Cancer Center
666-2, Nitona-cho, Chuoh-ku, Chiba 260-8717, Japan
Phone: +81 43 264 5431; Fax: +81 43 265 9515
E-mail address: nakaji@fc.med.miyazaki-u.ac.jp

August 31, 2005

The BioMed Central Editorial Team,
Tel: +44 (0)20 7631 9921; Fax: +44 (0)20 7631 9923

Dear The BioMed Central Editorial Team,

Enclosed please find a revised manuscript by Takahiro Nakajima, et al #4495155486528136 entitled: “A case of spontaneous regression of bone metastasis from renal cell carcinoma; Case Report”. We made changes in the text thoroughly according to referee’s comments. Now we believe it suitable for publication for “BMC Cancer”. We are looking forward to your reply.

Reply for the comments from referees is enclosed on a separate page.

Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Yours sincerely

Takahiro Nakajima, MD
To the Reviewer #1
Dear Dr. Christian Doehn,
We believe that the paper has been much improved, largely as a result of referee’s many thoughtful comments. I would like to explain below how we have responded to your comment.

1. The authors now cite 2 papers by Negrier et al. but these publications deal with immunotherapy when metastases are present. There is no controlled study demonstrating a benefit from adjuvant therapy after disappearance of metastases (either spontaneous or by biopsy/operation). Therefore, the authors should state that the patients was treated with Interferon under study conditions (which was probably not the case) or on an individual basis rather than supported by literature data.

We understand the reviewer’s comment in this aspect. There are no evidences that the adjuvant immunotherapy results are better than the observation for this kind of renal cell carcinoma patients. We have changed the sentence as follows in the conclusions area:

The patient is now receiving interferon therapy in our outpatient clinic on individual basis rather than supported by literature data to prevent recurrence of the tumor (7, 8, 9).