Reviewer's report

Title: KIAA0101 (OEACT-1), an expressionally down-regulated and growth-inhibitory gene in human hepatocellular carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 26 February 2006

Reviewer: Yoichi Furukawa

Reviewer's report:

General
By immunohistochemical staining and western blot analysis, the authors showed in this manuscript that expression of KIAA0101 protein was decreased in HCC tissues compared to non-cancerous liver tissue.

-----------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
1) Information of HCC etiology and clinicopathological data such as hepatitis infection in the samples should be included. I strongly recommend that the authors examine association between reduced KIAA0101 expression and clinicopathological data including the infection status.
2) Although they showed growth suppressive effect of KIAA0101 in a cell line, they should examine effect of KIAA overexpression in other cell lines. Observation in one cell line is not enough convincing because the suppressive effect might be the cell type-specific.
3) For the cell cycle analysis, FACS analysis should be carried out in triplicate. Data obtained by triplicated analysis may be demonstrated as a histogram or a table with standard deviation.

-----------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1) The authors should describe more clearly materials and procedures.
2) The manuscript contains a number of typing errors. They should check carefully throughout the manuscript.
3) A native English speaker should revise this manuscript, because it contains a number of grammatical errors and unusual descriptions.

-----------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-----------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.