Reviewer's report

Title: Differential expression of a new isoform of DLG2 in renal oncocytoma

Version: 2 Date: 3 April 2006

Reviewer: Andrew Young

Reviewer's report:

The authors addressed the principal concern about validating their finding in individual, independent tumor specimens. They also made changes to figure legends as suggested.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

In the revised manuscript, the authors state that Ensembl has mapped the DLG2 gene to 11q14.1. Although Ensembl and UCSC databases do indicate 11q14.1, several other genome databases indicate mapping to 11q21. Since this discrepancy has implications for the significance of the DLG2-FLJ37266 isoform, the authors should at least acknowledge it in the discussion section.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'