Reviewer's report

Title: Differential expression of a new isoform of DLG2 in renal oncocytoma

Version: 1 Date: 2 January 2006

Reviewer: Guorong Li

Reviewer's report:

One major problem in the differential diagnosis of renal tumors lies in the distinction between the chromophobe renal carcinoma and the benign oncocytoma. The chromosome aberrations of these tumors have been described. But their utilization is not clinically practical. The gene markers may be a new way for the molecular differential diagnosis. Unfortunately, there is no validated gene marker available.

This is a timely and clear article. The methods are adequate. The finding is of importance. The authors did not mention the tumor sample size. Only after the validation on a large scale of tumor samples can it be concluded that the new isoform of DLG2 is the promising gene marker for molecular differential diagnosis of renal oncocytoma. Since the marker is also expressed in normal and other types of renal tumors, the clinical utilization may not be easy. A cutoff has to be defined if quantitative RT-PCR or immunohistochemistry is used.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests