Reviewer's report

Title: Common variation in EMSY and risk of breast and ovarian cancer: a case-control study using HapMap tagging SNPs

Version: 2  Date: 30 May 2005

Reviewer: Jennifer Hu

Reviewer's report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. For item 1, authors should also consider Type II error. This is a genetic epi. study, not a clinical trial. I agree that it is not a good idea to over analyze data. However, common SNPs are not expected to have major impact on disease. Therefore, we emphasize the importance of exploratory analysis to identify potential gene-environment interactions for future testing. If authors do not wish to run some exploratory analysis, please include their justification in the paper.

2. For item 2, it will be important for authors to include the response in their paper, so it will be helpful for other investigators who may be interested in those 4 SNPs.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Response acceptable.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests