Reviewer's report

Title: Massive Tumor Lysis Syndrome and Multi-System Organ Failure Secondary to Replacement of the Liver with Metastatic Melanoma

Version: 1 Date: 20 December 2004

Reviewer: Helen Te

Reviewer's report:

General

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The signs of tumor lysis syndrome (TLS) are quite difficult to distinguish from the signs of a combination of hepatic failure and acute renal failure. In the setting of FHF, acute renal failure from hepatorenal syndrome is not uncommon, and can explain some of the metabolic abnormalities. The authors should provide an explanation or speculation of why they think TLS is the diagnosis, rather than simply a combination of sinusoidal hypoxia from tumor infiltration with liver failure and concomitant renal failure. The authors should also elaborate on why they think TLS occurred, as TLS in cases of malignant melanoma usually occurs after chemotherapy.

Overall, this paper is a good reminder to all of us to think of malignant melanoma as a potential cause of FHF in the appropriate setting.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I have no competing interests.