**Reviewer’s report**

**Title:** P-cadherin expression and survival rate in oral squamous cell carcinoma: an immunohistochemical study.

**Version:** 1  
**Date:** 31 March 2005

**Reviewer:** Alberto Gasparoni

**Reviewer’s report:**

The paper by Lo Muzio et al. is well written and deals with an interesting topic, i.e., the levels and cellular localization of P-cadherin in oral squamous cell carcinomas. P-cadherin is an intercellular adhesion protein, homologous to E-cadherin, but has been proposed to differ in function from E-cadherin on the basis of its different localization.

The paper supports a role for P-cadherin as an early marker of poor prognosis in oral squamous carcinomas. The statistical analysis appear to follow appropriate controls and the tables present results in a clear way.

**Discretionary Revisions**

As P-cadherin is expressed mostly in the basal layer, it would be interesting to observe its expression in dysplastic lesions, from moderate to severe, and how P-cadherin expression changes, in terms of cellular localization and intensity, at the beginning of connective tissue invasion.

**Minor Essential Revisions**

Page 2  
Line 2: - spell out E-cadherin and leave the acronym in parenthesis
Line 3: - especially in in vivo studies. should be read
Line 7: - a cohort of 67 OSCC patients was investigated should be read

Page 3  
Line 7-11: the sentence is too long

Page 4  
Line 8-9: - cancel repetition of verify
- there is only one aim of the study, i.e., to verify whether P-cad can be considered a marker of ; therefore, the beginning of the sentence should be more correctly read Aim of the present research was to verify

Page 4-5  
- Do censored cases include both dead patients and patients lost during follow up? It would appear so from page 4, line 5: plus cases censored (for death). and page 5, line 13: patients lost during the follow-up period (i.e., 72 months) were considered as censored.

Page 6  
Last line: allowed us
Major Compulsory Revisions

None, as the paper offers enough data to determine the prognostic value of P-cadherin and analyzes in detail patients' survival curves in relation to expression and other variables.

Level of interest

The paper by Lo Muzio et al. represents an article of importance in its field and whose findings are important to all the scientists who work on P-cadherin, study the expression of determinate antigens as prognostic markers in oral squamous cell carcinomas, and analyze tumour survival curves in relation to patients' habits, gender, lifestyle, cancer histopathologic grade and staging.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no financial or non-financial competing interests.