Reviewer's report

Title: Phase II Trial of Weekly 24-Hour Infusion of Gemcitabine in Patients with Advanced Gallbladder and Biliary Tract Carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 30 March 2005

Reviewer: Vittorio Gebbia

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors report a very small sized phase II trial on gemcitabine as continuous infusion in advanced galla bladder and biliary tract carcinomas. The paper is generally well written. However the results reported by the authors do not support in any way the use of gemcitabine as continuous venous infusion in such setting since the reported tolerance and overall response rate (as well as the stabililization rate) are not strikingly better than those known for short term administration of gemcitabine.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The authors must delete any comparison in clinical outcome among subgroups since this is a phase II trial and its is not a comparative study (i.e. survival of patients with disease control compared to that of patients with progressive disease, etc.). An other fundamental point is that it should be clearly stated in the conclusions section that this is a substantially negative report since no advantage for infusional gemcitabine may be suggested.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Presentation of results is good as well as english language format.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests