Reviewer's report

Title: Hypofractionated stereotactic re-irradiation: treatment option in recurrent malignant glioma

Version: 2 Date: 11 March 2005

Reviewer: Carsten Nieder

Reviewer's report:

General

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The authors report median time to tumor progression on imaging after HFSRT. However, they do not provide a definition of tumor progression. What criteria did they use?

2. Median overall survival from the first histological diagnosis of glioma should also be reported for GBM and AA as separate entities.

3. The authors obviously included at least one pediatric patient. The exact number of such patients remains unknown from the present manuscript. This needs to be corrected. I would strongly discourage reporting the results of pediatric glioma patients together with adult patients (different response to certain treatments, different survival, etc.). If there is only one patient in the series, that's o.k. because this patient's outcome is reported in sufficient detail.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.