Reviewer's report

Title: Reevaluation of the 22-1-1 antibody and its putative antigen, EBAG9/RCAS1, as a tumor marker

Version: 1 Date: 4 February 2005

Reviewer: Achim Jungbluth

Reviewer's report:

General

In their paper Re-evaluation of the 22-1-1 antibody and its putative antigen EBAG9/RCAS1 as a tumor marker, Reimer et al analyze biology and function surrounding the reactivity of mAb 22-1-1. The authors describe and elucidate discrepancies in the previous literature revolving around this mAb and its putative antigen.

The analysis including the biological assays is well done; the authors -for a good reason- avoid the term “specificity” when they describe mAbs 22-1-1 and Ab-1.

The paper is well written, a couple of commas are missing.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

None

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests