Reviewer's report

Title: A novel duplication polymorphism in the FANCA promoter and its association with breast and ovarian cancer.

Version: 1 Date: 16 February 2005

Reviewer: Michael C MacLeod

Reviewer's report:

Both reviewers are essentially correct: the findings are indeed of marginal statistical significance, but may still be of conceptual value to other workers in the field. While the more negative reviewer doesn't want to publish a ms. that might be found to be in error if a larger population were sampled, it seems equally likely that a larger population would validate or enhance the statistical significance. Perhaps a larger study is best left to another group.

My sense is to advise publication, but with a caveat. The most disturbing point about the ms. is that the slightly decreased incidence in the ovarian "cancer" group lacks statistical significance if only malignant tumors are considered. Therefore, I suggest publication only after the Abstract is modified to directly state this point. The authors currently dance around this finding, using the phrase "particularly those with benign tumors".