Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical practice guideline on the optimal radiotherapeutic management of brain metastases.

Version: 1 Date: 7 February 2005

Reviewer: riccardo soffietti

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
There are two points that I would suggest to consider:
Section Interpretation of the evidence:
1) a statement that from "well conducted retrospective studies in single brain metastasis radiosurgery yields results that are similar to those reported after surgical resection
2) there is a risk of late neurotoxicity (cognitive deficit, dementia) after radiation regimens employing a size fraction > 2 Gy

Section Draft recommendations:
As a consequence of point 2 above, in the paragraph "Radiotherapy and surgery for single brain metastasis", after the second point (postoperative whole brain radiotherapy...), I would add that "in patients with good Karnofsky score and minimal or/no extracranial disease, regimens employing a size fraction > 2 Gy should be avoided to prevent a late neurotoxicity".

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests