Reviewers report

Title: Increased staining for phospho-Akt, p65/REL and cIAP-2 in pre-neoplastic human bronchial biopsies

Version: 1 Date: 14 September 2005

Reviewer: Aaron P P Jansen

Reviewers report:

General

The authors seek to determine the status of proteins (phospho-AKT, p65/REL, and cIAP2) encompassing a pro-survival pathway prior to progression to cancer for human bronchial epithelia in developing intra-epithelial neoplasia by immunohistochemical analyses

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. Activation of Akt has multiple consequences leading to the formation of cancer. Because the focus of the ms is on anti-apoptotic pathways, rather than for example, invasion, it would be of interest to know the status of phospho-FKHR in the same samples that phospho-AKT was determined.

2. This manuscript would be greatly strengthened by showing a final figure with the antibodies used in this manuscript on a serial section of at least one sample. The authors appear to be suggesting that there is a link between upregulation of phospho-Akt, nuclear localization of p65/REL and increase in cIAP2 abundance. This reviewer is going to require that this analysis be done. However, the inability of showing all of the above effects on one serial sectioned sample should not stop the publication of this ms.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Page 10 end of 1st paragraph, change from figure 3E and 3F to figure 4E and 4F

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests