Reviewer's report

Title: Increased staining for phospho-Akt, p65/RELA and cIAP-2 in pre-neoplastic human bronchial biopsies

Version: 1 Date: 8 September 2005

Reviewer: Sug H Lee

Reviewer's report:

General
This paper extends several previous data that apoptosis inhibition is important in the pathogenesis of tumors. This paper showed the expression of the survival proteins in preneoplastic lung lesions as well as in frank carcinomas. Although these findings are interesting, little clinical significances of the data are assessed in this study.

---------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. The authors should describe the total number of the samples, number of samples in each histological type of the samples, and number of samples in each histological grade (mild dysplasia to carcinomas).

2. The authors includes adenocarcinomas in this study, but they do not included any figures for the adenocarcinomas. addition of the adenocarcinoma figures is required. Also, the authors should describe how they classify the preneoplastic lesions of adenocarcinomas.

3. The authors should include the clinical and additional pathological characteristics such as age/sex, TNM stage, survival, recurrence and chemotherapy response, and compare the protein expressions with these characteristics.

4. On page 5 in the Background section, part of the last paragraph may be for the Results section. I recommend to delete the part (after "Increased staining for phosphorylated Akt.....").

---------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

---------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'