Reviewer's report

Title: Membrane testosterone binding sites in prostate carcinoma as a potential new marker and therapeutic target: Study in paraffin tissue sections

Version: Date: 20 May 2005

Reviewer: James Mohler

Reviewer's report:

The authors have done an excellent job of demonstrating that the duration of time and temperature until tissue fixation as well as the repeatedly of fixation plays a role in their ability to demonstrate membrane androgen receptor. This is an excellent addition to their manuscript. However, the reviewers continue to be confused regarding the TNM system. They use the 1977 TNM system in spite of the fact that the TNM system has been altered many times since then with the most recent versions that are in common use from 1999, 2002 and now 2005. Their paper adds nothing by using the G1, 2, 3, 4 grading system except to confuse the reader. The rest of the world uses Gleason grade as should they. They find no difference in Gleason sum 7 with regard to whether pattern 3 or 4 is the primary grade and cite a paper by Dr. Wheeler that comes to the same conclusion. This is one of the few papers that reaches that conclusion and the works on much larger numbers of patients by Partin and Kattan all have reached the opposite conclusion. However, this is not a point that the authors need to address as the numbers of patients that they have studied is so small that one would not expect to see a difference between Gleason sum 7 with primary grade 4 vs. Gleason sum 7 with primary grade 3.

Finally, the paper continues to contain numerous typos and grammatical errors and the writing style is conversational not scientific. This paper requires heavy editing. An example of this is the convoluted paragraph 2 on page 11. These shortcomings should be addressed by the authors or I would not recommend publication.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests