Reviewer's report


Version: 1 Date: 8 June 2005

Reviewer: Pascale GROSCLAUDE

Reviewer's report:

General
The main goal of this paper is to analyze changes in total cancer mortality (only) in Ohio, and compare this to the national USA pattern. It discusses possible reasons for change in Ohio and for differences between Ohio and the USA as the whole.
A joinpoint regression was used to provide estimated annual % of change and to detect change in trends. Mortality rates are compared using the U.S. Standard Population for age adjustment.
The information included in this article is interesting and deserves to be published.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
However, it is a shame that the analysis was only done for all cancers. A separate analysis for each cancer site would have been much more informative and enabled a more interesting discussion.
If the authors think a global approach is justified or brings additional information compared to a detailed approach they should explain so. If a global approach was simply done because of the lack of detailed data, this should be stated.
The authors emphasize that mortality depends on the type of cancer and as they cannot give a detailed description of mortality, their conclusions are very general. One wonders if these conclusions come from the analysis of other publications, rather than from observations based on the results of the present study.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
Please put the figures “All ages” on the top in the figure 3 like in the figure 2

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests