Reviewer’s report

Title: Phenotypic and functional analysis of lymphocytes infiltrating bone-associated tumors: use as a new therapeutic approach of osteosarcoma

Version: 1 Date: 24 July 2005

Reviewer: Ian Frazer

Reviewer’s report:

General
This paper describes some properties of T cells derived by extended in vitro culture with IL-2 from a wide range of human bone tumors. These mixed cell lines, a mixture of CD4 and CD8 T cells, demonstrated non-MHC restricted cytotoxic activity for all tested tumor cell lines in vitro. In contrast, blood derived lymphocytes, similarly cultured, did not demonstrate LAK/ALK/NK activity against the same tumors. Similar results were obtained with cultured tumor infiltrating lymphocytes from rat tumors.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Indicate in figure 5 how many independent assays (i.e., how many independent tumors) were assessed in preparing these data.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Fix up minor errors in English grammar - especially those that change meaning. E.g., page 7 change Mean SD to Mean and SD.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Figure 1 would be substantially improved by indicating after each tumor type (e.g., plasmacytoma) how many samples results are represented in the figure and, on the chart, what the standard deviation of each data point was like (to give an indication of scatter about the mean). Same for Figure 3. Also SD for the numbers in Figure 5.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'