Reviewer's report

Title: In B-CLL, the codon 72 polymorphic variants of p53 are not related to drug resistance and disease prognosis

Version: 1 Date: 17 May 2005

Reviewer: eric solary

Reviewer's report:

The authors analysed a single nucleotide polymorphism at codon 72 of the p53 gene in 136 B-CLL samples to determine whether this polymorphism affects the ex vivo sensitivity of lymphocytes to seven cytotoxic drugs with various mechanisms of action and g-irradiation and the patient survival. No relation was found between the polymorphism and the status of patients, the IgVH-gene status, the p53 genotype, cell sensitivity to cytotoxic agents and survival. The authors conclude that this polymorphism has no clinical relevance in this disease. Their study was correctly performed and their data are in accordance with their conclusion.

The authors could improve the MS by addressing the following questions:
- Did the polymorphism affect survival of patients that did not receive any previous treatment?
- Is there enough patients to determine whether the polymorphism affected the response to a given treatment such as fludarabine?
- How the mutational status of p53 was determined and which mutations were found in 52 samples may be explained (it is said in the conclusion that mutations were searched in exon 5 to 8).
- Where and how were collected the cells? probably in peripheral blood but this may be indicated in the material and methods section.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests