Reviewer's report

Title: Antitumor effectiveness of different amounts of electrical charge in Ehrlich and fibrosarcoma Sa-37 tumors

Version: 1 Date: 22 August 2004

Reviewer: Yona Keisari

Reviewer's report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

a. The study was carefully carried out and well documented. Yet, the experimental groups are small and no statistical analysis is given for the in vivo experiments.

b. The analysis of cell infiltration is based on histochemistry. In order to be more specific it is preferable to use immunohistochemistry.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

a. The authors failed to cite important articles in the field (see below several examples from recent years).

b. Ref, #6 cited in the statistical criteria section should be #7.

c. The explanation for the death of animals in the high electric charge treatments is vague. Can it be attributed to toxic effects of the treatment, or to metastases?

References


Turler A, Schaefer H, Schaefer N, Wagner M, Maintz D, Qiao JC, Hoelscher AH. Experimental
low-level direct current therapy in liver metastases: influence of polarity and current dose.
Xin Y, Xue F, Zhao F. Effectiveness of electrochemical therapy in the treatment of lung cancers of

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the
major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research
interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I am working in the field of low electric field cancer treatment in combination with chemotheraoy. I
also filed a patent on this topic.