Reviewer's report

Title: Cytotoxic effects of Gemcitabine-loaded liposomes in human poorly differentiated thyroid carcinoma cells.

Version: 1 Date: 19 July 2004

Reviewer: Martin Schlumberger

Reviewer's report:

General Celano and colleagues report their findings comparing the cytotoxic effects of Gemcitabine and Gemcitabine-loaded in liposomes on an anaplastic thyroid carcinoma cell line. The title and the text is misleading: the study was performed on an undifferentiated or anaplastic cell line that should not be confused with a poorly differentiated thyroid cell line. Results are clear and well-presented, but authors should not be too optimistic because they do not bring any data suggesting that their findings is relevant in vivo. In tumor sensitive to gemcitabine, is there any relationship between tumor uptake of the drug and cytotoxic effect? Does this increase in cell uptake of the drug also observed in other cell types, is it tumor specific?

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: None