Reviewer's report

Title: The impact of surgery and mild hyperthermia on tumour response and angioneogenesis of malignant melanoma in a rat perfusion model

Version: 7  Date: 1 May 2004

Reviewer: Joerg Faulhaber

Reviewer's report:

General

The manuscript by Pelz et al. evaluates the effect of hyperthermia and surgery on tumour response and angioneogenesis in isolated limb perfusion of xenogenic malignant melanoma in the nude rat. The results of this study indicate that surgical manipulation promotes tumor growth, probably via induction of growth factors (bFGF), external hyperthermia of 41.5 °C tissue temperature has no impact on tumor growth/angioneogenesis and hyperthermic isolated limb perfusion effectively suppresses tumor angioneogenesis respectively tumor growth.

The experiments are conducted very carefully and hypothesis-based. The manuscript is well written and all findings are carefully discussed. Overall, this is an interesting study and I have only a few minor revisions.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Figure 2: The authors must present the data as means ± SEM. In the legend of Figure 2, authors should describe, which groups were compared. For a reader it lacks enough information to understand what was analysed.

2. Figure 2: label of y-axis - 3 should be superscript.

3. Introduction (second paragraph): "Angioneogenesis has been recognized for many years to play a central role in the growth of primary tumors and the formation of metastases in general." The authors should add one or two important references.

4. On page 3, second paragraph, first sentence: After the sentence "." is missing.

5. On page 15, Acknowledgements: After the sentence "." is missing.

6. On page 16: Replace “Literature” with “References”.

7. Replace p, indicating the significance level, by P (and italic) throughout the manuscript.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:
None