Author's response to reviews

Title: Primitive Neuroectodermal Tumor (PNET) of the kidney: a case report.

Authors:

Dr Giorgio Pomara (g.pomara@libero.it)
Francesco Cappello (francapp@hotmail.com)
Maria G. Cuttano (mg.cuttano@med.unipi.it)
Francesca Rappa (francapp@hotmail.com)
Dr Girolamo Morelli (g.pomara@libero.it)
Dr Pierantonio Mancini (g.pomara@libero.it)
Cesare Selli (c.selli@dc.med.unipi.it)

Version: 3 Date: 30 Nov 2003

Dear Sirs,

We have read with interest the comments of BMC Cancer referees about our manuscript entitled: "Primitive Neuroectodermal Tumor (PNET) of the kidney: case report and carcinogenic hypothesis". One reviewer's report approved the manuscript without revision then we have modified it according to the other reviewer's report.

In detail the following modifications have been done:

According with general, discretionary as well as minor compulsory revisions:
* The editing and spelling corrections suggested were made
* The number of reported renal PNET was included in the Background section
* Differential diagnosis was placed in Discussion instead of Results

According with major compulsory revisions
* Title has been changed accordingly with reviewer's comment: "Primitive Neuroectodermal Tumor (PNET) of the kidney: a case report". In the conclusion section of the abstract the sentence "We hypothesised that" was then deleted.
* Another figure (fig.1), with its legend, was added showing the H&E features of the tumor including H-W rosettes.
* We underlined in the discussion, as suggested, that MIC-2 gene products are known also as CD99, 12E7, E2, 013 and HBA71
* We added reference number 13 reporting another recent published case report in which only CD99 immunoreactivity is used to address the diagnosis of PNET, to justify our uncommon finding. We also discussed this issue taking account of other reported cases.

Written informant consent, signed by the patient, will be mailed/faxed tomorrow.

We hope that in the present version the manuscript can be considered suitable for publication. Hoping to hear from you soon, yours sincerely

Giorgio Pomara MD