Reviewer's report

Title: Overexpression of the Duffy Antigen Receptor for Chemokines (DARC) by NSCLC Tumor Cells Results in Increased Tumor Necrosis

Version: 2 Date: 16 June 2004

Reviewer: Stephan Segerer

Reviewer's report:

General

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
The Title of the citation should not be included in the first sentence of the manuscript. (The citation of the first description as a blood group was in Nature 1950, p188,189 by M. Cutbush et al)

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
My main concern was that the conclusions drawn from this system, which are valid, might not be extrapolated to the in-vivo situation of human diseases. Expression of DARC on endothelial cells as opposed to tumor cells might lead to different results. Therefore it would have improved the manuscript significantly, if the authors would have provided evidence of DARC expression in human cancer cells or restricted the conclusions to the model system used. This was not addressed in the revised version.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No