Reviewer's report

Title: Characterization of human mesothelin transcripts in ovarian and pancreatic cancer

Version: 1 Date: 1 March 2004

Reviewer: Christine Iacobuzio-Donahue

Reviewer's report:

General
Accumulating evidence indicates that mesothelin is a specific and potentially useful target for anti-cancer therapy. In this study by Muminova et al., the authors have provided data corresponding to the expressed transcript and splicing variants of the mesothelin gene in human ovarian and pancreatic cancers with correlation to published genomic data. This manuscript is well written, technically sound and provides useful information for development of antimesothelin targeting.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
None

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1. The materials and methods section regarding DNA sequencing methods (page 9) does not indicate the measures taken to rule out sequencing errors when analyzing the data. This may seem a minor point, but considering the authors claim that some reported transcripts are due to sequencing errors, the precise methods to insure that the sequencing results obtained are accurate are of particular relevance. For example, were sequences determined in the forward and reverse directions, determined in two separate amplifications from the original templates, etc.?

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

None