Reviewer's report

Title: Core I gene is overexpressed in Hurthle and non-Hurthle cell microfollicular adenomas and follicular carcinomas of the thyroid.

Version: 1 Date: 15 December 2003

Reviewer: Todd G Kroll

Reviewer's report:

General:

This manuscript by Maximo et al presents the characterization of some mRNAs identified in human thyroid tumors using differential display. Apparent strengths of the work include the use of pathologically well-defined and relatively pure (as determined by frozen section examination) tumor and normal tissues. Apparent weaknesses include the use of only RTPCR to document core I expression levels in a relatively small tumor series. In my view, the work seems preliminary and no strong clinical and/or mechanistic correlates are apparent. The range of core I expression in the tumors appears to be quite modest at best and the original hypothesis that core I expression might correlate with the Hurthle cell/oxyphillic phenotype is not well supported.

Compulsary issues:

I think more rigorous documentation of core I expression using other techniques such as northern blots, western blots, and/or immunohistochemistry is required and the addition of increased numbers of cases seems warranted if clinico-pathologic correlates of core I expression are to be thoroughly assessed.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

none