Reviewer’s report

Title: Association between HIF-1alpha C1772T/G1790A polymorphisms and cancer susceptibility: An updated systematic review and meta-analysis based on 41 case-control studies

Version: 2

Date: 3 November 2013

Reviewer: Jue-Yu Zhou

Reviewer’s report:

Generally speaking, the authors haven’t answered my questions sufficiently well. For example, I suggested that they should group the three studies that used the same controls (ref. 29) as one in the analysis for the whole population. Actually, it is not so according to Figure 2 and Figure 3 in the revised manuscript. Also, the results of the meta-analysis seem to be very confused although sub-analysis based on cancer type in different ethnicities has been conducted in the revised manuscript. Additionally, the authors did not list the number of sample size for each comparison which I think it is very useful for indicating the power of the results.

More importantly, a new systematic review and meta-analysis with the same topic was published in Tumor Biology (Hu et al. The association between HIF-1# polymorphism and cancer risk: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Tumor Biol. 2013 Sep 18.). In the above meta-analysis, Hu et al. conducted an estimation of the relationship between four polymorphisms in this gene (C1772T, G1790A, C111A and rs2057482) and cancer risk, and obtained the similar conclusion with this study. Therefore, it lost its characteristic of novelty from this point of view.

In addition, it is questionable that the author “Ailin Lu” was deleted and the author “Ning Liu” was added in the revised manuscript, which was contradictory with the section of Authors’ Contributions.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests