Reviewer's report

Title: Predict model: Ki67 validation

Version: 2 Date: 8 October 2014

Reviewer: John Professor Boyages

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

This is an excellent study and a useful contribution to the literature.
I found Table 1 a little confusing at first as I thought I was looking at % 10-year mortality until I noticed one of the results was over 100.

In the text it refers to Table 1 as follows:

The observed and predicted numbers of deaths by 7 clinical characteristics are shown in Table 1.

Strongly suggest that Title is changed to reflect that this is a number (that is deaths) and not a rate or %.

Table 1: Observed and predicted breast cancer specific mortality at ten years by clinical characteristics

Minor Essential Revisions

I'm not really sure of the necessity of adding AURKA reference in the introduction. I must admit this has not even hit my radar or indeed the 2013 St Gallen Report. It is not covered again in the discussion. I think the paper would benefit from a focus on Ki-67 rather than the potentially thousands of other predictors out there.

Page 6 Line 25; ER+ pts = 1275; line above it is 1274 (please explain or correct)

Page 7; Line 5- I would prefer to see how often the data was missing to help the reader understand how often values were imputed for the variable studied.
Suggest ass (% available for each variable)

Bottom of Page 10, Top of Page 11. Suggest add this reference where we did sensitivity analyses of Ki67 and found 10% to be the ideal cut-off point

Discretionary Revisions

Page 9, Line 23- I made a comment re - cost of Oncotype Dx which was then addressed further down. The authors could combine both these sections or at least say somewhere that PREDICT is quick to use, free and available for decision making at the clinician desk-top.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests