Reviewer's report

Title: Quantitative assessment of the asphericity of the pretherapeutic FDG uptake as an independent predictor of outcome in NSCLC

Version: 3  Date: 2 October 2014

Reviewer: Twyla Bartel

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

1) Identify if SUV is calculated by body weight, lean body mass, etc.

2) Table 2 is not referenced in the body of the text.

3) Would include statements on how readily this would be available to clinicians and its impact on management decisions.

4) Include something on whether or not they had additional metastatic disease and how this might relate.

5) There is mention of "coarse 3-dimensional ROI." Explain this a bit further for the reader.

6) There is mention of a minimum 3 ml volume. Why was this chosen?

7) Has this been compared to non-malignant lesions? It is known that FDG can have nonspecific uptake also in inflammatory or infectious processes.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.