Reviewer's report

Title: Eligibility criteria for breast intra-operative radiotherapy: a study about 12,025 patients treated in two distinct cohorts

Version: 6  Date: 6 July 2014

Reviewer: Dennis Holmes

Reviewer's report:

1. In general, this is a well written article that provides a nice discussion of the topic, but it contributed little new data to the field aside from emphasizing the view that IORT is likely suitable for most patients with screen detected breast cancer. The patient also demonstrates that the inclusion criteria for their RIOP trial are too stringent.

2. However, this is mostly of internal value. There are already well-established consensus guidelines by ASTRO, ABS, ASBS, ESTRO identifying suitable candidates for ABPI. The current studies does not expand upon that dataset.

3. The abstract is very difficult to read and comprehend. If published, it should be simplified.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I am co-chair of the TARGIT-U.S, IORT Registry trial, which should bias me in favor of an article expressing support for IORT. However, as stated above, I think the current article contributes little to the topic.