Reviewer's report

Title: Men's knowledge and Attitudes Towards Dietary Prevention of a Prostate Cancer Diagnosis: a qualitative study

Version: 1 Date: 24 August 2014

Reviewer: Kathy Chapman

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions

General Comments

• The article needs a good edit, verb tenses need reviewing throughout. Should consistently use past tense in the discussion section.
• The reference list needs thorough editing and proof reading.
• In the introduction there should be more discussion around the strength of the evidence for green tea and lycopenes
• Incorporate quotes into the results sections, rather than presenting as a long list as a separate table

Page 1 Title

Line 1 – Please check title for consistent use of capitals

Page 2 - Abstract

Line 53 – The purpose of the study used in the abstract does not match the study description and results. The study DID NOT establish the feasibility of dietary interventions for the prevention of prostate cancer. This was qualitative study to determine the beliefs and attitudes of men with prostate cancer towards dietary interventions. The study did not establish if any dietary interventions were feasible – this is overselling the findings and study design.

Line 57 – 133 Men who previously… men doesn’t need a capital and sentence should not start with a figure.

Line 58 - … who were at increased risk of the disease were randomly allocation to both… should read … who were at increased risk of the disease were randomly allocated to …

Line 59 – It is not clear what the intervention arms for the trial were – were participants randomised to lycopene (...) or green tea or lycopene and green tea together

Line 65 - Could the participants who had a negative biopsy result have had a higher PSA level?

Page 3
Background

Line 80 - PC is most prevalent among high-income countries – should be in high income countries

Line 85 – ……to no benefit to those receiving active treatment – clunky phrasing, please revise

Lines 87-90 – this section could flesh out the strength of the evidence base for these particular dietary factors in more detail, and be clearer that the evidence is suggestive rather than conclusive

Line 89 - [7] is an old reference – check World Cancer Research Fund report for a more up to date reference

Line 96-103 – This section of the introduction goes off topic and is not relevant to elaborate on in this much detail

Line 106 - Sentence would be better if it read… However, the knowledge and attitudes (of men at increased risk of PC) towards dietary modification are unknown…..

Page 4 - Methods

Line 117 - Can’t start a sentence with a figure. (133 men without evidence of PC…)

Line 117-119 – Messy sentence structure

Line 119 - Sentence is missing a beginning…. Try inserting, Participants who were… at the beginning

Line 123 – please make clearer what were the intervention arms of the trial. Were participants allocated to green tea, lycopene, and BOTH green tea and lycopene intervention groups. The description is confusing

Line 133 - It is not clear if the people interviewed were on diet interventions

Page 5

Line 137 - Don’t abbreviate MREC

Data Analysis

This paragraph on page 5 is a good description of the analysis of the themes

Line 141 – instead of … were arising… use the word, arose.

Line 142 - insert the word ‘that’ between guides and were… e.g…. were used to refine the topic guides that were explored…

Results

Page 5

Line 155 – Hyphenate socio-economic

Line 156 - Use colon and semicolons to make this sentence more readable. E.g.
Three major themes were identified during the analyses: knowledge of all cancer risk factors; attitudes towards dietary modification with green tea and lycopene; and attitudes towards dietary modifications for disease prevention.

Line 157 and line 200– The sub heading in the results text doesn’t match the third theme “attitudes towards dietary modifications for disease prevention”

Page 6
Line 180 - Aging – different spelling used throughout the manuscript.

Page 7
Line 194 – Add and food preferences – Eating more tomatoes was seen by many to complement existing eating habits and food preferences…”

Page 8
Line 223 - Use were instead of are… but were uncertain about…
Line 233 – Use ‘similar to’ instead of ‘as in’. … information from the media and, similar to previous surveys, overwhelmed…
Line 244 – clunky phrasing “lack of engagement of dietary modification” – please revise
Line 246 – Commence a new paragraph at “our findings….”
Line 250 – Dietary recommendations should be plural

Page 9
Line 253 – Typo complemented
Line 261 - We used standardised qualitative methods… is this correct?
Line 265 - It should be stated more clearly that the fact that all participants were Caucasians was a study limitation
Line 272 - Should be … Data suggest that not Data suggests that as data is a plural word

Conclusions
Line 278 - men would welcome consistent advice from their clinicians and the media about

Page 10
Line 280 - Clinicians need the results of the intervention trials to inform what their dietary messages should be.

Page 12 – Table 1
Table 1 - Remove italics
Table 1 - what does ‘intermediate’ Occupational class mean?

Page 13 – Table 2
Table 2 - The quotes should be interwoven into the results text.
It is extremely hard to read the verbatim transcripts with all the 'ers', and I believe including them shows a lack of respect for the participants who took part in the study.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests'