Reviewer's report

Title: Diagnosis and Staging of Superficial Esophageal Neoplasm based on Pre-Endoscopic Resection System Comparable to Endoscopic Resection

Version: 2 Date: 20 March 2014

Reviewer: Daniel Oh

Reviewer's report:

The authors investigate a relevant issue in endoscopic therapy for superficial esophageal squamous cell carcinoma - the accuracy of non-invasive endoscopic techniques to determine whether an early esophageal cancer is suitable for ablative therapy or whether esophagectomy is indicated. Traditionally, the authors have used endoscopic mucosal resection (EMR) to make this determination. The combination of techniques used to replace EMR includes the appearance on EGD with Lugol's solution, Paris classification of the lesion, EUS, and endoscopic biopsy - the authors call this "the pre-ER test" or pre-endoscopic resection test.

The conclusion of the study is an important contribution to those clinicians who perform endoscopic therapy on early esophageal cancers. However, the manuscript is very difficult to interpret and would benefit from an editor or writer who could improve its readability. Second, a statistician should be included in this study since it is based on the premise of ROC and AUC calculations to justify its conclusions, and a formal statistical analysis would be helpful to determine if this is truly the best method of answering the authors' questions. Third, many of the references in this manuscript are from Chinese journals and cannot be accessed for review. With some major revisions, this study would be suitable for a major gastroenterology journal.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.