Reviewer's report

Title: Survival in Overweight Patients with Advanced Pancreatic Carcinoma: A Multicentre Cohort Study

Version: 2 Date: 29 May 2014

Reviewer: Albert Amini

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written paper on Obesity in advanced pancreatic cancer. However, there is one problem with their statistics. Although the authors categorized BMI into four groups, Table 2 does not account for that. They are assuming that because increments in BMI (by 5 units) has a HR of 1.21 that there would also be a difference in the BMI groups as well. They are not being consistent in how they are handling the variable of BMI. I would like to see them maintain BMI as a categorical variable and therefore compare the higher BMI groups to their reference BMI group (likely BMI 18.5 – 25).

1. Minor Revision – Revise Table 2 to reflect BMI broken down into their four groups
2. Minor Revision – Please address small sample size of obese (BMI>30) group in limitations.
3. Minor Revision – Please address why underweight (BMI<18.5) patients do worse (figure 1) after 18 months. Could being underweight also have worse survival? This would have implications in Stage 1 and 2 patients that have better survival.
4. Minor Revision – Stratifying Table 1 by BMI group would help understand the similarities/difference between the groups

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests