Reviewer's report

Title: Physical activity and renal cell carcinoma among black and white Americans: a case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 20 March 2014

Reviewer: A Ari Ari Hakimi

Reviewer's report:

The authors investigate the effect of physical activity on RCC risk. They should be commended on investigating the impact of race on this interaction and assessing the impact of other confounding well know risk factors such as hypertension and BMI. I am a bit surprised that there was no interaction between BMI and activity and leads me to question how accurate the level of physical activity was measured in this cohort. Further because the cohort is relatively small its makes me concerned that the effect measured are real. Perhaps we are just seeing surrogates for BMI. Nevertheless, because the findings are in a well annotated cohort, and because the epidemiology or RCC and black patients is poorly understood, I believe the paper warrants publication.

I would like to see a external statistician review the way the authors determined the interaction between BMI and level of activity.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests