Reviewer’s report

Title: GPC3 reduces cell proliferation in cell lines of renal carcinoma

Version: 1  Date: 3 July 2014

Reviewer: George Michalopoulos

Reviewer’s report:

The authors present very interesting results in expression of GPC3 in renal cell carcinoma and the growth-inhibitory effects of GPC3 in renal cell carcinoma cell lines. The results are well described and presented and support the conclusions of the authors.

Minor essential revisions:

1. In Fig. 1A Comparisons are made to the “normal renal tissue”. Since kidney histology is heterogeneous, which component of the normal tissue was the comparison made? Proximal, distal renal tubules, loops of Henle, etc.?

2. In a previous manuscript by Okon, Pol J Pathol. 2008;59(1):15-20, GPC3 was found over-expressed in chromophobe renal cell carcinomas. The authors should address this in their discussion and comment whether they also observed this in their studies, as a point of distinction between regular (clear cell) and chromophobe renal cell carcinomas.

3. The authors should also briefly discuss expression of GPC3 in other types of cancer and stress that GPC3 is highly over-expressed in hepatocellular carcinoma, in contrast to the renal cell CA.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I do not have any competing interests.