Reviewer's report

Title: TACE performed in patients with single nodule of hepatocellular carcinoma

Version: 2
Date: 21 April 2014
Reviewer: Ripal T Gandhi

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written paper with a well defined question, appropriate methods, sound data (though retrospective in nature), and balanced conclusions on the basis of their data. With a few revisions which are delineated below, I believe that the work would merit publication:

Major Compulsory Revisions -

1. I would like to have more technical information regarding the actual TACE procedure. Specifically, how much Lipiodol was used, what is the dose of Epirubicin which was used, etc.

2. The authors conclude on the basis of their results that TACE is a valid treatment option in patients with single HCC not suitable for curative treatment. Ablation modalities are commonly used in patients with single HCC who are not eligible for transplantation or surgery. In the discussion, it would be very helpful for the authors to discuss published studies on ablation for solitary HCC and compare and contrast data for TACE vs ablation. The reader may also be curious to know what the authors' treatment of choice is for a solitary HCC < 5 cm (and < 3 cm) on the basis of their data - TACE or ablation (in patients not eligible for transplant or surgery)

Minor Essential Revisions: 

1. What was the median or mean length of stay after TACE procedure

2. It is our practice to not routinely obtain labs on the day after TACE. It would be useful if the authors can discuss their protocol for obtaining labs and whether they believe it should be obtained in all patients on the basis of their results.

3. A change in Child Pugh or MELD is not going to change whether the patient is treated; it would be helpful if the authors can address if there is any significance to these results other than being poor prognosticators for survival

Discretionary Revisions - None

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests