Reviewer's report

Title: Toxicity of definitive chemoradiation in patients with inoperable or irresectable esophageal carcinoma

Version: 3 Date: 2 August 2013

Reviewer: kuai-le zhao

Reviewer's report:

Mohammad et al retrospectively compared the toxicities of patients with inoperable esophageal cancer and that of patients with irresectable esophageal cancer. The results showed that the grade #3 toxicity was significantly more often in the inoperable patients than in irresectable patients. Hospital admission occurred more often in the inoperable patients than in the irresectable patients.

1. The inoperable patient means that the patients suffer from medical diseases, their performance status are lower, or they are older. The inoperable patients’ tolerance to chemotherapy and radiotherapy is lower. So, it is easy to understand that “toxicity is worse in the inoperable group compared to the irresectable group”.

2. For this study, the authors did not detail describe the toxicity of chemoradiotherpay(see table 3). It is very important that let us know the detail serious toxicity, because the different medical diseases affect differently the tolerance to chemotherapy, radiotherapy, even different chemotherapeutic drugs.

3. In table 2, the authors did not describe the range of patients’ age in the two groups. From the data of table 2, we believe that the age is the important factor affecting the toxicity of radiotherapy.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.