Reviewer's report

Title: Toxicity of definitive chemoradiation in patients with inoperable or irresectable esophageal carcinoma

Version: 3 Date: 19 July 2013

Reviewer: zhang shumin

Reviewer's report:

Review
This paper mainly focuses on the observation of toxicity of definitive chemoradiation for patients with inoperable or irresectable esophageal carcinoma retrospectively. This study is partial on the acute adverse effect such as the blood toxicity and the esophagitis, however, the chronic toxicity was not listed due to the no occurrence such as the esophageal perforation or fistula, hemorrhage, stenosis and obstruction, also no radiation-induced lung injury? The regimen of chemoradiation would be best standarized and extended. This is major comments. The authors should considered minor revised as listed below:

1. The numbers of two group patients is in wide gap (33 vers 94), so the statistical results may be influenced. Please consulate the statistician.

2. The adopted version of TNM classification should list.

3. The complete ration of chemotherapy and radiation is not full expect the death in the administration. Please show the reason.

4. The determinants of toxicity should be more supplied such as the T classification and the respiratory function etc. Univariate and multivariate analyses should be provided. And so the toxicity can be analyzed and be comprehensive plus the listed above.

5. The cause of death should be added. The toxicity is wore in the inoperable group, but the survival of the two group is not significantly different.

6. Some grammar should be corrected especially the punctation.

If these questions were revied and completed, maybe I advise the acceptance of the study.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.