Reviewer’s report

Title: Association between p53 codon 72 polymorphism and risk of oral squamous cell carcinoma in Asians: A meta-analysis

Version: 1  Date: 31 March 2014

Reviewer: Carolina Gomes

Reviewer’s report:

In the manuscript entitled “Association between p53 codon 72 polymorphism and risk of oral squamous cell carcinoma in Asians: A meta-analysis”, Zeng and colleagues assess the association between the p53 codon 72 SNP and the development of OSCC. Although the study was well conducted, there are some issues that need to be addressed.

Major compulsory revisions:

Abstract:
1) “Only the cases in the studies with immunohistochemical staining of OSCC were considered.”

It is not clear what immunohistochemical staining the authors are mentioning. Please, clarify this information.

2) In conclusion, current result suggest that p53 codon 72 polymorphism is not associated with OSCC in Asians who without HPV infection but associated with HPV-related OSCC patients.”

As only 2 studies included in this meta-analysis reported HPV-status information (about 200 OSCC patients), the authors should consider not to include such information in the abstract and conclusions. I feel that the authors overestimated this finding in their manuscript, just because there was a positive association.

Introduction
3) The authors state that “Oral squamous cell carcinoma (OSCC) derived from the flat cells (squamous cells) that cover the surface of the mouth”, however, despite the squamous phenotype, there is no evidence that such cancer is derived from the flat cells. This “flat cells” origin information is found in sites for “patients”.

Discussion
4) “In 2011, Heah et al., indicated that p53 expression is a marker of microinvasion in OSCC which contradicts the results of our meta-analysis.”

The authors did not assess p53 expression nor OSCC microinvasion. They need to revise this sentence.
Minor essential revisions:

1) As non-native English speakers, the authors should consider a professional English language revision.

2) In addition, several typing errors are found throughout the text, as follows:
“HPV-nonrelated OSCC cases it is not clear whether the p53 codon 73 OSCC susceptibility n Asians; the subgroup”

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests