Reviewer's report

Title: Identification of prognostic factors and surgical indications for metastatic gastric cancer.

Version: 2
Date: 25 February 2014

Reviewer: Shishir K Maithel

Reviewer's report:

Major:
1. The authors do a reasonable job at emphasizing the importance of patient selection in this series. This needs to be highlighted a bit more directly stating that the manuscript is not advocating for a surgical approach for patients with metastatic gastric cancer routinely.

2. Was HER2 status known or reported? If amplified, were any of the patients treated with herceptin?

3. The median time from diagnosis to surgery was reported to be 1.9 months. This seems terribly short for this patient population. Why didn't patients get a longer course of chemotherapy prior to resection? This message cannot be advocated to operate this soon after diagnosis. These are highly selected.

4. On the KM curves for survival, the number of patients represented by the curve at each of the time points needs to be included. The authors report that 75% of patients have died. Given patients who are lost to follow up are censored, which in this case very likely may have died, the tail end of the curve likely represents very few patients....again emphasizing the highly selective nature of this approach.

5. Was intraperitoneal chemotherapy used for any of the patients?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: None