Reviewer’s report

Title: Survival advantage of partial over radical nephrectomy in patients presenting with localized renal cell carcinoma

Version: 2 Date: 2 April 2014

Reviewer: Vitaly Margulis

Reviewer’s report:

major revisions:

given discrepancy between large body of retrospective data and the prospective trial, it is essential to provide oncologic and functional outcomes (at least renal function outcomes). this should support the hypothesis that improved survival in patients treated by NS are driven by improved preservation of renal function with ensuing benefits.

authors must soften the conclusions that Ns provides improved OS, given the retrospective nature of the study with significant confounders which are not adjusted for, such as detailed assessment of pre surgical comorbidity.

a more rigorous comparison, perhaps propensity matching may strengthen the conclusions of the study.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

no competing interests