Reviewer's report

Title: Down-regulation of Sirtuin 3 is associated with poor prognosis in hepatocellular carcinoma after resection

Version: 2 Date: 2 September 2013

Reviewer: Nadja Lehwald

Reviewer's report:

The revised manuscript by Wang et al entitled “Down-regulation of Sirtuin 3 is associated with poor prognosis in hepatocellular carcinoma after resection” has substantially improved. According to our comments, the authors have satisfactorily replied to all major concerns. Furthermore, they have performed additional experiments which were shown in the supplementary data. However, nothing is explained in the manuscript about the new data. It would be nice if the authors could briefly mention the results of the new supplementary data within the results section.

The overall conclusions of the manuscript remained the same, but have further been strengthened by newly added data.

In summary, we believe that the revision has strengthened the manuscript and will be of great interest to the readership of BMC Cancer.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'