**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Down-regulation of Sirtuin 3 is associated with poor prognosis in hepatocellular carcinoma after resection

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 5 July 2013

**Reviewer:** Deborah Stroka

**Reviewer's report:**

Please number your comments and divide them into

- **Major Compulsory Revisions**

  1) Originality of the study: With particular attention to references Nrs. 19 and 32, the authors should clearly state the novelty of their study.

  2) The western blot analysis comparing pT to T, clearly shows samples with greater pT levels (Samples 1 and 2) and some with greater T levels (Sample 45 and 46). In addition, some internal controls GAPDH are not present (sample17 T). Based on these observations, the authors need to clarify how they scored and reported a decrease of Sirt3 in figure 3B.

- **Minor Essential Revisions**

  The author can be trusted to make these. For example, missing labels on figures, the wrong use of a term, spelling mistakes.

- **Discretionary Revisions**

  These are recommendations for improvement which the author can choose to ignore. For example clarifications, data that would be useful but not essential.

Please note that both the comments entered here and answers to the questions below constitute the report, bearing your name, that will be forwarded to the authors and published on the site if the article is accepted.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
'I declare that I have no competing interests'