Reviewer’s report

Title: Feasibility of intensity-modulated and image-guided radiotherapy for locally advanced esophageal cancer

Version: 2 Date: 28 July 2013

Reviewer: Megan Daly

Reviewer’s report:

The authors report a small retrospective review of 10 patients treated with IMRT for locally advanced esophageal cancer. A major limitation of the study is the small population and heterogeneous population (both definitive and post-operative patients with positive margins) and heterogeneous dose selection. The doses used, as the authors also note, are in excess of those generally used for esophageal cancer.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1) The median follow up in the study is 14 months, yet the authors report Kaplan Meier 2 and 3 year estimates of overall survival. This is inappropriate, given that the median follow-up is much shorter.

2) In this particular instance, including the survival curve as a figure would be helpful. They report on 7 out of 10 patients’ death, within a median follow up of only 14 months, yet report 2 and 3 year survival estimates of 50% and 40%, respectively. A curve that shows times of death and censoring would be helpful to clarify event and censor times

Minor Essential Revisions

None

Discretionary Revisions

None

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests